

To: Naranjo, Eugenia[Naranjo.Eugenia@epa.gov]
From: Clifford Firstenberg
Sent: Thur 1/5/2017 3:23:12 PM
Subject: RE: EPA comments on Tierra Fish Data Report

Eugenia – when we spoke this morning, I forgot to ask about this. If we don't have clarification, I plan to submit the RTCs with the questions as below. I'll hold off until later today (maybe early afternoon?).

Thanks
Cliff

-

Clifford E. Firstenberg
Principal and Environmental Sciences Manager
Tierra Solutions, Inc.

E-mail: cfirstenberg@tierrasolutionsinc.com

Phone: 757-282-6462

Cell: 757-206-6281



CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE...

The information in this email may be confidential and/or privileged. This email is intended to be reviewed by only the individual or organization named above. If you are not the intended recipient or an authorized representative of the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any review, dissemination or copying of this email and its attachments, if any, or the information contained herein is prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender by return email and delete this email from your system.

Thank You.

From: Clifford Firstenberg
Sent: Tuesday, January 03, 2017 1:09 PM
To: 'Naranjo, Eugenia' <Naranjo.Eugenia@epa.gov>
Cc: 'Warner, Len' <lwarner@louisberger.com>
Subject: RE: EPA comments on Tierra Fish Data Report

Eugenia – Happy New Year! I hope you enjoyed your travels, family, and time away from work.

We are wrapping-up our RTCs on the Fish Data Report and have one comment that that we don't fully understand. See below:

Comment

No.	Section	Page	Comment	Tierra Response
16	Table 2-6 (and similarly formatted tables)	Table 2-6 (and similarly formatted tables)	(a) Please add an explanation to Footnote 1 that the fish family is comment. Footnote 1 says that used if samples were not identified to species and explain why this was done. (b) Please revise Footnote 2 to explain specifically when individuals were not included in the total. Please clarify the meaning of the phrase “if species within family collected	(a) We do not understand this comment. Footnote 1 says that the table includes target species that were not needed (sample was already mass attained) or of insufficient size (did not meet the length requirement) (b) Footnote 2 refers to the last row of the table for total

by gear”.

number of species collected with each gear. This statement refers specifically to the Clupeidae collected with trawl (19 species total excluding Clupeidae) as we already counted other clupeids (e.g., American shad is in Clupeidae family), otherwise we would be double counting taxa. Are we misunderstanding the comment?

If you can get LBG (or Battelle) to clarify we can address this one outstanding comment and incorporate it into our pending submittal.

Thanks
Cliff

Clifford E. Firstenberg
Principal and Environmental Sciences Manager
Tierra Solutions, Inc.

E-mail: cfirstenberg@tierrasolutionsinc.com

Phone: 757-282-6462

Cell: 757-206-6281

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE...

The information in this email may be confidential and/or privileged. This email is intended to be reviewed by only the individual or organization named above. If you are not the intended recipient or an authorized representative of the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any review, dissemination or copying of this email and its attachments, if any, or the information contained herein is prohibited. If you have received this email in error, please immediately notify the sender by return email and delete this email from your system.

Thank You.

-----Original Message-----

From: Naranjo, Eugenia [<mailto:Naranjo.Eugenia@epa.gov>]

Sent: Tuesday, November 29, 2016 2:40 PM

To: Clifford Firstenberg <cfirstenberg@tierrasolutionsinc.com>

Cc: Carlie Thompson <cthompson@tierrasolutionsinc.com>

Subject: EPA comments on Tierra Fish Data Report

Attached EPA's comments on the Fish Data Report. Thanks, eugenia

Your message is ready to be sent with the following file or link attachments:

2016-11-29 Tierra Fish Data Report Comments NBSA-EPA.docx